



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

Results of the meeting

*UNDP-GEF Project “Integrated Natural Resource Management
in the Baikal Basin Transboundary Ecosystem” (the Project)*

<http://baikal.iwlearn.org>

The Russian Federation and Mongolia

Third regional Steering committee meeting

Gremyachinsk, Russia

July 24, 2014

Chairman: Vladimir O. Mamaev, UNDP-GEF Regional Technical Advisor
Secretaries: English – Boris V. Baduyev
Mongolian – Tumurchudur Sodnom
Russian – Larisa D. Radnaeva

Program of the meeting: [download](#)

List of participants: [download](#)

Presentations, reports, information materials: <http://baikal.iwlearn.org/ru/proekt-1/rukovodiyaschii-komitet/trete-zasedanie>

Purpose of the Second Steering committee meeting:

Presentation of results, achieved by the Project in 2013, work plan and budget of 2014; consideration of the Project mid-term evaluation, made by an independent international expert; consideration of development progress of SAP for the lake Baikal basin and discussion of enhancement of international cooperation in the field of use and protection of transboundary water resources between Russia and Mongolia.



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

The Third regional Steering committee meeting was held on July 24, 2014 in Gremyachinsk, the Republic of Buryatia, Russia.

Opening of the meeting

Vladimir O. Mamaev opened the meeting and briefly informed the participants about purposes of the meeting.

The participants of the meeting were welcomed by:

National project technical director in Russia Alexander A. Shekhovtsov on behalf of national project coordinator in Russia, Deputy Head of the Federal service for supervision of natural resource usage of the Russian Federation Amirkhan M. Amirkhanov;

Head of hydrology department of Institute of meteorology and hydrology Davaa Gombo on behalf of national project coordinator in Mongolia, Deputy minister of environment and green development of Mongolia Tulga Buya.

Minister of nature resources of the Republic of Buryatia Yuri P. Safyanov;

Head of National water committee of Mongolia Badrakh Tsend;

Deputy Head of Yenisey basin water management of Federal Water Resources Agency of the Russian Federation Valery S. Molotov.

Project's results achieved in 2013

This issue was presented by the Project manager Sergey V. Kudelya, who reminded the participants that 2013 results were sent out to every Steering committee member in the beginning of 2014 and were published on the official website of the Project ([download](#)).

Later on Sergey V. Kudelya gave a detailed report on work done in 2013 and incurred expenses.

After that, the national project technical director in Russia, Alexander A. Shekhovtsov, and the national project technical director in Mongolia, Tumurchudur Sodnom, dwelled on each result achieved within the scope of the project implementation in 2013 by Russian and Mongolian organizations and individual consultants respectively.

The presented results of 2013 did not arouse any discussions and were accepted by the Steering committee.

Results of the mid-term evaluation of the Project - [materials](#)

On this issue the participants of the meeting listened to the Regional coordinator of UNDP-GEF, Vladimir O. Mamaev, who in the beginning of his speech reminded the participants that the mid-term evaluation of the Project was a planned activity and obligatory for every project implemented under the auspices of UNDP-GEF.

Later on he reported about the mid-term evaluation, made by the independent international expert Josh Brann, and the evaluation results which were sent out to each Steering committee member in June 2014.

After that, Vladimir O. Mamaev reported in detail about the evaluation results and recommendations, made by the independent international expert. Vladimir O. Mamaev suggested to the Steering committee members that their comments, if any, should be sent to the Business management unit of the Project within 2 weeks after completion of the meeting.



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

Sergey V. Kudelya suggested to the Steering committee members to endorse possible actions of the Business implementation unit regarding each suggestion of the independent international expert ([download](#)).

In the course of the round table discussion of different questions related to the mid-term evaluation results and received comments from the Steering committee members, the following conclusions were done and decisions were taken:

- To accept the mid-term evaluation of the Project;
- To send comments and remarks to the Business management unit within 2 weeks;
- To support majority of recommendations except those, which contain necessity of a new agreement between the Russian Federation and Mongolia in the field of international water resources due to the fact of that a draft of such an agreement had been developed according to request from the Steering committee and sent to interested organizations of the Russian Federation and Mongolia, and its further consideration goes beyond the scope of the lake Baikal Project competence (there is a more detailed consideration of this issue in the Agenda item “Enhancement of international cooperation in the field use and protection of transboundary water resources between the Russian Federation and Mongolia”).
- To support the recommendation of expanding pilot activities on the Mongolian side, for example, to assist in the implementation of developed sub-basin watershed management plans for Eg and Ider rivers.
- To support the idea of holding of international conference, dedicated to the 20th anniversary of cooperation between the Russian Federation and Mongolia in the field of environment protection.

On development of the Strategic Action Programme (SAP)

Working version of SAP was printed in English and Russian and distributed among the Steering committee members in 2 weeks prior to the meeting date.

International consultant, Paul Gremillion, who was hired for this position as a result of the consultant contest and led the work on SAP development, reported on process and steps of SAP development, its connections with the Transboundary diagnostic analysis of the lake Baikal basin and further development actions.

Later on, he dwelled on SAP structure, tasks and strategic actions, defined by SAP experts, and performance indicators.

Vladimir O. Mamaev noted that it is necessary to understand that SAP, signed by both countries, will be a ground for additional funding from GEF for the purposes of its implementation and will start next phase of UNDP Project.

Valery S. Molotov emphasized the importance of keeping of SAP development standards, used in other countries, and especially evaluations of their financial support.

Additionally, the Steering committee members noted short time period for SAP development and pointed out the necessity of additional consultations in appropriate ministries and agencies, and if needed, involvement of additional consultants.

Sergey V. Kudelya agreed that available funds and time period are not enough for SAP development, and it is necessary to reallocate the funds among components of the 2015 budget and to extend the period of SAP development and consultations in countries at least till June 2015.



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

The Steering committee members noted that in the course of final SAP development and holding of consultations it is very important to identify the agency responsible for SAP implementation. The Russian-Mongolian commission for environment protection was suggested as such possible mechanism here.

During the round table discussion of different issues related to SAP, the following conclusions were made and decisions were taken:

1. Members of the Steering Committee have been introduced to the process of SAP development and agree to submit the SAP draft to the countries for comments and possible consultations, and within these consultations try to evaluate the budget estimations required for the implementation of the priority strategic actions.
2. To entrust the Project manager Sergey V. Kudelya to make the 2015 budget revision for the purpose of finding of additional funds for successful completion of SAP;
3. To extend the period of SAP development till June 2015;

Improvement of international cooperation between the Russian Federation and Mongolia in the field of use and protection of transboundary water resources.

The international law expert, Sergey V. Vinogradov, presented a review of modern condition of legal and institutional structure of cooperation between the Russian Federation and Mongolia on use and sustainable development of transboundary water resources, and suggested variants of their improvement. Later on, he dwelled on main chapters of the Agreement on cooperation in the field of protection and sustainable development of transboundary water basins between the Russian and Mongolian governments, which was developed in the performance of a decision of the Second regional Steering committee meeting.

After the speech of Sergey V. Vinogradov, the representative of the Department of international cooperation of the Russian ministry of nature resources and ecology (MinPrirody of Russia), Abidat M. Magomedova, presented the following position on this issue:

- With the purpose of realization of the Russian-Mongolian Agreement on cooperation in the field of environment protection dated from February 15, 1994 (hereinafter referred to as the Agreement), there was the third meeting of the Joint Russian-Mongolian commission (hereinafter referred to as the Commission) in the MinPrirody of Russia on October 28, 2013. After the meeting a protocol of the Commission meeting was signed. According to resolution # 551 of the Russian government from May 07, 1997 Amir Khan M. Amir Khanov, Deputy head of RosPrirodNadzor, was assigned as a Head of the commission from the Russian side;
- Regarding the issues of realization of the Russian-Mongolian Agreement on protection and use of transboundary waters dated from February 11, 1995 (hereinafter referred to as the Agreement), the Agreement sets a procedure of bilateral Russian-Mongolian cooperation, there is a mechanism of its realization – institute of plenipotentiary of governments, there is a procedure of plenipotentiary meetings and procedure of expert work of bilateral working group on protection and use of transboundary waters within the scope of the Agreement.
- Activity of plenipotentiary of governments is regulated by appropriate normative-legal basis, state organizational-technical and financial support, what provide necessary and sufficient conditions for setting, acceptance and coping with tasks of protection and rational use of the Russian-Mongolian transboundary water objects. Directions of bilateral Russian-Mongolian



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

cooperation in transboundary water sphere, stated in Article 5 of draft Agreement, are realized by the parties within the scope of existing Agreement;

- In reference with the above, we do not find it reasonable to make changes in existing Russian-Mongolian intergovernmental agreements, including agreement on cooperation in the field of environment protection between the Russian and Mongolian governments, successfully implemented by the Russian MinPrirody and Federal Agency of water resources, dated from February 15, 1994 and Agreement on protection and use of transboundary water between the Russian and Mongolian governments dated from February 11, 1995;
- At the same time we do not think it reasonable to further consider presented draft Agreement on cooperation in the field of protection and sustainable development of transboundary water basins between the Russian and Mongolian governments with the purpose of its possible conclusion.

Ministry of environment and green development of Mongolia also presented the following position regarding this issue:

- Agreement on protection and use of transboundary water between the Russian and Mongolian governments dated from February 11, 1995 is effectively realized by both parties and does not required revision and renewal;
- Existing mechanism of Plenipotentiaries adequately reflects current goals and tasks of both parties and there is no need in creation of a new mechanism such as this commission.

During the next round table discussion, the following decisions were taken:

- To take into account position of the Russian MinPrirody and Ministry of environment and green development of Mongolia;
- To pass developed draft Agreement on cooperation in the field of protection and sustainable development of transboundary water basins between the Russian and Mongolian governments to the Russian-Mongolian intergovernmental commission on economic-trade and scientific-technical cooperation, and to stop any works related to its improvement within the scope of the lake Baikal Project;
- On request from the parties, to hold consultations with international experts assistance on improvement of legal and institutional structure of cooperation in protection and sustainable development of transboundary water resources between the Russian Federation and Mongolia, within the scope of existing agreements.

Workplan and project budget for 2014

The Project manager, Sergey V. Kudelya, in the beginning of his report reminded the SC Meeting participants, that the workplan for 2014 was distributed among the SC members in the beginning of 2014 same way it was done for the 2013 progress report ([download](#)). The Project manager mentioned that the Lake Baikal Project carefully abided by the Project document budget, which was signed by the Governments of both countries, without considerable deviations. In the beginning of 2015 a workplan for relevant period will be distributed among SC members for approval, taking into consideration the recommendations made by the SC members during this Meeting and consultations for SAP development.

Later on, Sergey V. Kudelya presented workplan and budget for 2014-2015 (Table 1) ([download](#)).



Empowered lives.
t nations.

Project Outcomes	Total budget (USD)	Expenditure 2011+2012	Expenditure 2013	Proposed Budget 2014	Proposed Budget 2015
Outcome 1: Strategic policy and planning framework					
	\$ 917 930.00	\$ 486 312.97	\$ 292 882.27	\$ 109 425	\$ 29 309.76
Outcome 2: Institutional Strengthening for IWRM.					
	\$ 751 534.00	\$ 242 852.27	\$ 218 659.92	\$ 184 500	\$ 105 521.81
Outcome 3: Demonstrating methods and approaches for water quality and biodiversity mainstreaming.					
	\$1 844 174.00	\$ 202 329.09	\$ 517 112.47	\$ 623 080	\$ 501 652.44
Project Management	\$ 384 362.00	\$ 102 990.12	\$ 98 744.84	\$ 92 210	\$ 90 417.04
TOTAL	\$3 898 000.00	\$1 034 484.45	\$1 127 399.5	\$ 1 009 215	\$ 726 901.05

Table 1. Project budget and expenditures.

After the presentation, Vladimir O. Mamaev suggested discussing the workplan and 2014 budget.

During the discussion, Mongolian SC Members paid attention to the importance of the implementation of management plans for Eg and Ider rivers sub-basins and work result sharing with interested Mongolian parties in the field of mining pilot projects, which were implemented by Russian organizations on the territory of the Republic of Buryatia.

Besides, the Mongolian SC Members recommended finding the possibility for additional funding for pilot projects in Mongolia.

In addition, UNDP Mongolia drew attention to the fact that the all projects within Mongolia agree detailed budget of each activity with SC members, and stressed that this practice allows providing more in-depth analysis of annual work plan.

Sergey V. Kudelya informed SC members that PCU always follows restrict rules of the regional UNDP and UNOPS of preparation of annual working plans, budget and tenders.

Next, Sergey V. Kudelya mentioned that one of recommendations of the independent international expert, who made the mid-term evaluation, is no-cost extension of the Project up to the end of 2015. The Project management unit supported this recommendation and asked the SC members for their approval. There were no demurs from the SC members.



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

After that, Sergey V. Kudelya presented a draft of changes, which were suggested to be made in the Project document, according to the recommendations of the independent mid-term evaluation expert.

Draft amendment 1:

Page 67 – The structure of strategic results

Indicator	Baseline	Target	Sources of verification
Pollution levels in hot spot monitoring areas.	Mercury, other mining pollutants at elevated levels in hot spot areas. Specific levels to be discussed at inception.	Reduction by at least 20% in target areas by the end of the project.	Field monitoring results.

Proposal for amendment:

To exclude this indicator from the structure of strategic results due to impossibility of real demonstration of pollution reduction by 20% even for selected objects.

Decision for this amendment 1: All SC members agreed with the amendment, but Vladimir O. Mamaev noted, that the indicator has global value and can be excluded only after agreement with GEF. The project manager, Sergey V. Kudelya, should clear the possibility of exclusion of this indicator with UNDP and GEF.

Draft amendment 2:

Page 78 The structure of strategic results

	Indicator	Baseline	Target	Sources of verification
Outcome 2: Institutional strengthening for IWRM.	Governments of Russia and Mongolia extend/do not extend legal status to Joint Commission on Baikal Basin.	Joint Russian-Mongolian Task Force on Transboundary Waters Use is not a legal entity.	Legal status obtained under Russian and Mongolian law by end of year 3.	Memorandum of Agreement Approved, organizational status papers revised.
	Full-time Executive Director of Joint Commission appointed/not appointed.	No full time director of Joint Task Force.	Appointed by year 4.	Appointment letter from relevant Russian or Mongolian organization.

Proposal for amendment:

Replace these two indicators from the structure of strategic results with one indicator according to the countries requisition changes, which will be amended as follows:

Objective/Components/Outcomes	Indicator	Baseline	Target	Sources of verification
Outcome 2: Institutional strengthening for IWRM.	Cooperation agreement between the Governments of Russia and Mongolia in the field of protection and sustainable development of transboundary water basins.	Joint Russian-Mongolian workgroup for usage of transboundary water is not a legal entity	The agreement has been developed by the end of third year. The consultations have been conducted in the countries.	The letters from the appropriate agencies. The minutes of state-to-state committees meeting.

Decision for suggested amendment 2:



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

All SC members agreed with this amendment with the remark “after clearance with GEF”. The project manager, Sergey Kudelya, was assigned to clear the possibility of replacement of this indicator with UNDP and GEF.

In the end of his report, Sergey Kudelya presented the key dates and stages of the Project implementation in 2015 for discussion:

- **January, 2015** – presentation of 2014 results; 2015 workplan and budget approval.
- **July-August, 2015** – Final Steering Committee Meeting of the Project;
- **September, 2015** – Final evaluation of the Project;
- **October-December, 2015** – Closure of the Project.

There were no demurs from the SC members.

Closing of the meeting and decisions:

On the basis of presented reports, provided information and results of discussions, the Steering Committee has taken the following decisions:

1. To take into account the results, achieved by the Project in 2013.
2. Members of the Steering Committee have been introduced to the process of SAP development and agree to submit the SAP draft to the countries for comments and possible consultations, and within these consultations try to evaluate the budget estimations required for the implementation of the priority strategic actions.
3. To extend SAP development period up to June 2015 and assign the Project Manager to revise the 2015 budget for finding of additional funds for successful completion of SAP development.
4. To take into consideration positions of the Russian ministry of nature resources and ecology and the Ministry of environment and green development of Mongolia regarding inexpediency of further development of the Agreement between the Russian and Mongolian governments on cooperation in the field of protection and sustainable development of transboundary water basins.
5. To submit the developed draft of cooperation Agreement between the Government of Russia and the Government of Mongolia in the field of preservation and sustainable development of transboundary water basins to the Joint Russian-Mongolian Intergovernmental Commission on Trade, Economic, Scientific and Technological Cooperation. To stop any activities for its improvement within the framework of the Lake Baikal Project.
6. To continue support of existing structures and mechanisms, especially holding of Plenipotentiaries meetings and meetings of their working group within the scope of implementation of 1995 Agreement on protection and use of transboundary waters between the Russian and Mongolian governments, as well as implementation of the Russian-Mongolian Agreement on cooperation in environment protection.
7. To accept the project mid-term evaluation results. Submit the comments to the Project Management Unit within two weeks.
8. To agree with recommendations, made by the independent international expert for mid-term evaluation, except those, which contain necessity of a new agreement between the Russian Federation and Mongolia in the field of international water resources.
9. To support the recommendation of expanding pilot activities on the Mongolian side, for example, to assist in the implementation of developed sub-basin watershed management plans for Eg and Ider rivers.



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

10. To support the idea of holding of international conference, dedicated to the 20th anniversary of cooperation between the Russian Federation and Mongolia in the field of environment protection.
11. To approve, in general, the workplan and the budget for 2014-2015 after amendments in accordance with the SC members recommendations.
12. To recommend approving of the two Project document amendments listed above.
13. For the SC members - to submit comments on the provided documents to the Project management unit within two weeks after the completion of the meeting.
14. To hold the 4th regional Steering committee meeting in the period of July-August 2015.
15. To make the final evaluation of the Lake Baikal Project in September of 2015.